

Annex 2. Place Based Services

Introduction

1. This document outlines the detailed business case for the Street Based Services work stream within the Place Based Services Project.
2. This builds on the Cabinet Rewiring reports in February, July and October that set the scope and targets, proposed the programme of work and updated on engagement and evidence building activity. This report updates Cabinet on proposals to re-evaluate a series of operational services in the short to medium term. This includes waste and recycling, public realm, highways and street lighting and related services such as fleet, workshop and depot management. However, other projects are referenced in the report.

Process

3. This report follows a process of resident and community engagement, supplier engagement and peer review, to place residents at the centre of the work and understand current best practice. The proposals made are a direct result of this engagement and look to achieve the best possible outcomes whilst achieving value for money.

Objectives

4. The principle objectives of this project are to:
 - shift the balance to communities and put residents in the driving seat in terms of service delivery and design;
 - produce a sound evidence base for the transformation work; and
 - look at innovative approaches where appropriate, whilst working in the context of maintaining where possible service levels and managing a reducing budget.
5. The Council has a history of self delivery of these services and there is an expectation from residents and members that the services will be responsive, flexible and deliver the outcomes of two council Priorities. These are protecting the built and natural environment and providing safe neighbourhoods where communities can thrive.

Priorities

6. The efficient and effective management of waste is one of the City of York Council's (the Council) top strategic priorities under the Protect the Environment priority.
7. The objective in the next 18 months is to develop the waste management service to ensure that it is customer centric, achieves required outcomes around waste prevention, reuse, recycling and disposal and is financially sustainable.
8. This will be achieved through a programme of work that focuses on reducing landfill, increasing reuse and recycling, ensuring that the service is efficient and maximising opportunities around commercial waste.

Engagement

9. Through the summer a comprehensive programme of engagement was initiated to start to shift the balance from council control of services to a more community/resident led approach. This would mean communities and other groups having more involvement in the redesign of services, decision making and where appropriate delivery of services. The programme was run under the "Transforming Places Together" banner.
10. The "Transforming Places Together" process started with the engagement of groups based on geographical location and their special interest. The geographical groups were well established forums, such as ward committees, parish councils and residents' associations. The special interest groups consisted of environment groups (voluntary, community and other) operating in York. This included "Friends of" groups, Edible York, York Wildlife Trust, St Nicks and others. As a result of these meetings, key relationships have now been forged.
11. Information gathered from two wider Rewiring engagement events were also fed into this process and themes identified to use as the basis for moving work forward. These are:
 - That front line services such as waste and recycling are seen as important;
 - We need to understand our role in building a sustainable city with particular focus on recycling and carbon reduction;

- There is an appetite to get involved in initiatives such as composting and sustainable food production;
- We need improved and innovative communications for communities;
- There is a need to support the development of voluntary/community groups;
- There needs to be better access to assets; and
- People want influential community warden type roles.

12. There is a strong sense within the groups that practical projects would be a good way forward in terms of engendering the culture that is mutually desired. These projects would be short term and have short term goals in order to test the practicalities of the themes and would then, if successful, be scaled up and rolled out at a wider level. It is also clear that to achieve maximum benefit, the council needs to support these groups over a period of time. In the short term this support could include funding, potential training and help to bring outcomes together at a City/regional level to ensure that good practice is shared.

Community led projects

13. The suggested projects are as follows:

- **Community safety project in Rural West.** This project would focus on tackling issues with crime, cold calling and community communication within the Rural West area. This would include a review of the process from the point of identification of an issue, the reporting, prevention and intervention in the short and long term. Ideas being tested include:
 - simple ways of reporting such as creating messages through digital TV and social media devices; and
 - enabling local communities to direct prevention methods such as the placement of number plate recognition cameras.
- **Community safety project in The Groves.** This project will focus on managing alcoholism and intimidation in the Groves area.
- **One planet living app.** The purpose of this project is to bring together the City's sustainability approach and link to the One Planet Living framework. Community groups are working with

the Council to build an app that provides value to residents that includes practical recycling information, alerts for refuse collection days and links into existing services.

- **Sustainable garden waste.** Providing community composting sites and allowing community group users such as Edible York to benefit from the produce. This is linked to a transformation in the offer of garden waste services to residents.
- **Empowered community capacity.** This project will look at the creation of more empowered community capacity when dealing with the built and natural environment.

14. The key to the success of these projects is that they are community led and community groups are involved in the development of the project briefs and will lead the delivering the tasks within the project.

Current service performance/peer review

15. Dovetailing with the community work has been an initial assessment of the current delivery of service, with a continuing review of how these services are delivered elsewhere in the United Kingdom and in European cities.

16. A key element to the future and sustainability of services in York is strengthening work with communities, particularly on service design and operational matters. In the community engagement work the relationship is in development and there are activities, in grounds maintenance for example, where due to the nature of vegetation there is a necessity to focus large amounts of resource for a short period of time. Some of these activities would be very suitable to be handed over to community groups.

17. It is also important that the Council focuses on delivering statutory work, priority jobs and where it is not possible to work with communities (for example, residual waste collection). In order to ensure that the best levels of service are maintained, the areas focused on by community groups and the council teams, would be supplemented by offering services at a cost where those services are discretionary.

18. There is a requirement to focus on front line delivery and to ensure that management and supervision is developed across services and streamlined. This includes implementing technology where required

to ensure that as much resource as possible is focused on front line delivery. Around 80% of expenditure in these services areas is labour and as budgets decrease it is important to manage the reduction in available resource. The Council is responsible for a large number of assets such as vehicles, buildings and tools and these need to be used safely to get full value from them.

Supplier engagement

19. In order to ensure that the services the Council delivers are best value it has been necessary to engage with potential suppliers to review how they operate similar services and how they get the maximum benefit from the resource available to them.
20. This has taken the form of informal discussion with local and national deliverers and this will be extended in the New Year to ensure a robust evidence base is held. The Council will invite a number of leading suppliers to discuss the transformation of services and how we can improve outcomes in York.

Interventions summary

21. In terms of service transformation, a series of interventions have been identified that would start to move the services towards delivering customer based and financial outcomes. These are:

Waste and recycling

- Garden waste subscription charges;
- Optimise kerbside recycling services;
- Reduce residual waste collection frequency;
- Optimise bring site provision;
- Review bulky waste collection charges;
- Review assisted collection service;
- Review clinical waste collection;
- Develop commercial waste collection service;
- HWRC permits and charges; and
- Interim residual waste contract (Apr 15 to Mar 18).

Review of cleansing

- Optimise cleansing through effective zoning, scheduling and response times; and
- Optimise litter bin provision and servicing to reduce number of rounds.

Review of grounds maintenance

- Opportunities for community involvement – over 6,400 hours* per annum at top 30 sites, including:
 - Bowling greens – 1,500 hours;
 - Tennis courts – 150 hours;
 - Bedding plants – 888 hours; and
 - Roses – 882 hours.
- Replacement of bedding plants with ornamental grass at 18 sites could potentially save 1,519 hours of labour; and
- Community compost schemes.

Cross cutting

- Reduce management & supervision

Highway maintenance and street lighting

22. The Council has a statutory duty to keep the highway safe for all highway users going about their daily business. The service is currently consulting on a reduction in workforce and a significant restructure in the way the service is operated. In addition to Highways maintenance the service is also consulting on the removal of the pest control function and restructuring of the stone masons capability in order to bring current costs in line with previously agreed Saving. Capital investment in street lighting should see a significant reduction in electricity consumption and carbon footprint if approved through the CRAM process. Reductions in the revenue budgets for 15/16 are being made to meet priority based budgeting targets and changes in working practices for gully cleansing and the interaction between Highways Maintenance and Capital programmes are being developed in order to ensure the Highways function can contribute fully to savings targets through transformation of delivery rather than service, as little room exist for service transformation in this area.
23. The highway asset has been generally deteriorating but a slower rate than many other authorities over a number of years, and is therefore in a relatively good condition compared to other authorities in our family group and one off pot hole funding from central Government is also mitigating this position. The Highways service are seeking to maintain the good quality of York roads relative to other Authorities through innovation in delivery however budgetary saving will increasingly impact on the ability to retain the current position.

Financial targets

24. The total spend in the areas in scope (Waste and recycling, Highway maintenance and street lighting and public realm) is in the region of £16m with income coming back to the council of around £3m. The table below (Table 1) illustrates the financial targets for this transformation programme.

Description	2015/16 £M	2016/17 £M	2017/18 £M	Total £M	Notes
Legacy service pressure in waste approx. £400k included	0.931	0.750	0.750	2.431	
Public realm transformational work	-0.250	-0.250	-0.250	-0.750	
Waste services transformational work	-1.800	0.000	0.000	-1.800	Minimum implemented Nov 15
Net total	-1.119	0.500	0.500	-0.119	
Potential with different delivery model. Across all depot based services assumed saving (5% in additional to figures above post March 2017)	0.000	0.000	-0.350	-0.350	
Net total	-1.119	0.500	0.150	-0.469	

Intervention detail

25. In order to meet these challenges the table below (Table 2) illustrates the interventions required. Where there is no value identified next to a

Intervention	Description	2015 /16	2016 /17	2017 /18	Total
WR01	Garden waste collection charge - Introduction of charge for all garden waste collections - This option brings significant financial benefit. - Suggested fee £35 per container per year (figures based on take up of 35,000 residents) - Option to possibly not delivering the service at all (budget saving approximately £1.3m)	-1.092	-0.437		-1.529

WR02	<p>Co-mingled recycling collections</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Revert from customer separating recyclable material to comingled collection - Dependency on Harewood Whin site MRF being reconfigured to handle comingled material. Not cost affective if using currently available facilities (Scarborough) 		-0.142		-0.142
WR03	<p>Reduce frequency of residual waste collections</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This would be reducing collection frequency to 3 weekly or 4 weekly - Other authorities who have implemented this combine this with a food waste collection - The nearest food waste disposal facility is Driffield. The cost of transporting the food waste outweighs the benefit of dropping to a less frequent collection. Consequently there is no case, that falls within the affordability criteria, for the implementation of a food waste collection - General rounds efficiency can be achieved without reduction in frequency of collection. Dependent on other decisions. 	TBC	TBC	TBC	
WR04	<p>Optimise bring site provision</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Remove provision of plastic bottle banks and educate to place in recycling box (significant difference in cost between kerbside collection and collection at bring bank) 	-0.020			-0.020
WR05	Review bulky waste collection charges	TBC	TBC	TBC	
WR06	<p>Review assisted collection service</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ensure that all residents qualify for this scheme 	TBC	TBC	TBC	
WR07	<p>Introduce clinical waste collection charges</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Will go to paying for service, but residents using this service are amongst the most vulnerable - Review the material in clinical waste collections and look to educate to divert to residual what can go in residual collection and work with other agencies (NHS) to collect this material. 			-0.010	

WR08	Develop commercial waste services <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This is dependent on the direction of travel of YorWaste and the authority's strategy once this is clear. - Development of this business has proved difficult in the past. 	TBC	TBC	TBC	
WR09	HWRC permits and charges <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Look to enforcing charges for non residents - Look to extend, where possible material charged for. 			-0.170	
WR10	Interim residual waste contract (Apr 15 to Mar 18) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Look at options in advance of Allerton park. 	TBC	TBC	TBC	
	Savings identified	-1.112	-0.579	-0.180	-1.871
	Target savings	-1.081	-0.500	-0.500	-2.081
	Affordability Gap	0.031	0.079	-0.320	-0.210
Intervention	Public realm				
SC01	Review zoning, scheduled cleansing and response times <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Working to statutory requirements and priority areas where possible - This will mean a reduction in the general standard 	-0.068	-0.068	-0.063	-0.198
SC02	Optimise litter bin provision and servicing	-0.030			-0.030
GM01	Reduce volume of work through design and greater community involvement <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - This will include the introduction of more durable flora in certain areas to reduce maintenance requirements - This will mean a reduction in the general standards 	-0.063	-0.063	-0.063	-0.189
GM02	Increased community involvement in management of allotment sites	-0.015	-0.015		-0.030
PR01	Reduce management & supervision <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Management and supervision reduced to match resource levels. - These changes will be considered across all operational services 	-0.040	-0.040		-0.080
PR02	Annual efficiency savings on unallocated consumables and other costs	-0.010	-0.010	-0.010	-0.030

	Savings identified	-0.226	-0.196	-0.136	-0.557
	Target savings	-0.250	-0.250	-0.250	-0.750
	Affordability Gap	-0.025	-0.055	-0.114	-0.193
	Place Based Service summary total				
	Waste and recycling	-1.112	-0.579	-0.180	-1.871
	Public realm	-0.226	-0.196	-0.136	-0.557
	Savings identified	-1.338	-0.775	-0.316	-2.428
	Target savings	-1.331	-0.750	-0.750	-2.831
	Affordability Gap	0.007	0.025	-0.434	-0.403

Next steps

26. The next steps are:
- Recognition/acknowledgement of the available proposals in terms of the interventions; and
 - Engage further with communities, partners and suppliers on potential interventions, work on the detail and plan the implementation.

The future

27. The work described is part of the journey of transformation. It is likely that whatever the short term model is, the medium to longer term model will involve further partnerships with other organisations. This could be community and voluntary groups or private sector. This would not be a significant leap as a sizable amount of work is already commissioned to other providers where work of a specialist nature is required, or where the council does not have the in-house capacity or capability. In the New Year we will develop options to determine what future models may be appropriate for the City.
28. In the medium to longer term, the Carbon and Energy programme, which is part of the wider Place Based Services project, will explore schemes around Renewable energy. These will contribute to becoming a greener city and improve energy usage and the management of carbon other emissions.